

The Wethersfield Historic District Commission held a Public Hearing on October 22, 2013 at the Wethersfield Town Hall, Town Manager's Conference Room – First Floor, 505 Silas Deane Highway, Wethersfield, Connecticut.

Members Present: Robert Garrey, Chairperson
Michael Rell, Vice Chairperson
Douglas Ovian, Clerk
Mark Raymond
Cynthia Greenblatt, Alternate

Members Absent: John Maycock
Lisa Wurzer, Alternate

Also Present: Kristin Stearley, Historic District Coordinator
Linda Messina, Recording Secretary

Commissioner Garrey called the meeting to order at 7:30 PM, and read the opening comments. Commissioner Ovian, Clerk, read the Legal Notice as it appeared in the *Rare Reminder* on October 10, 2013.

APPLICATION NO. 4206-13. William Gary Lopez seeks to construct a 12'x25' single story addition on the rear of the house at 8 Avalon Place.

Applicant was not present.

APPLICATION NO. 4207-13. George Bartholomay seeks to replace the wood siding with vinyl siding at 2 Howard Avenue.

George Bartholomay, 2 Howard Avenue, and Matt Normandin, L&M Building & Remodeling, 25 Tupelo Place, Middletown, appeared before the Commission. They would like to use Mastic Milcrete vinyl siding. A sample was provided. The color would be Scottish Thistle. The cornerboards will match the siding. The window wrap and the trim on the rake will be white. The section on the side of the house that is now tongue and groove will also be sided. There will be vinyl louvered shutters in the color Plum.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application. There being no one, this portion of the hearing was declared closed.

APPLICATION NO. 4208-13. Cactus Design LLC seeks to modify Certificate of Appropriateness number 4157-13 to change the siding from cement board to vinyl and to change the open wood trellis over the rear deck to a solid roof at 65 Robbinswood Drive.

Gary Vivian, Cactus Design LLC, 43 Old Pewter Lane, appeared before the Commission. Drawings were submitted. For the siding, they would like to use the same exact manufacturer and the same exposure except in a vinyl product. The main reason for the change is cost but there is also less maintenance involved with the vinyl product. A sample was provided. The color will be Granite Gray. They would also like to change the open wood trellis over the rear deck to a solid roof. They will reduce the number of columns. The material on top is now asphalt shingle to match the house roof.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application. There being no one, this portion of the hearing was declared closed.

APPLICATION NO. 4209-13. Cactus Design LLC seeks to amend Certificate of Appropriateness number 4157-13 to 1) modify the kitchen window width by 8", 2) modify the two (2) sets of 5' wide sliding doors on the south elevation to one 10' wide sliding door, 3) reduce the soffit height from 10'6" to 8'8", 4) decrease the window heights by 8", and 5) remove the brackets beneath the front bay window at 65 Robbinswood Drive.

Gary Vivian, Cactus Design LLC, 43 Old Pewter Lane, appeared before the Commission. They would like to reduce the width of the kitchen window by 8". They would like to have one 10' sliding atrium door on the south elevation. It will have four panels and the two center panels will slide open. They would like to reduce the soffit height completely around the house from 10'6" to 8'8". They would like to reduce the window heights by 8". They will remove the two brackets from beneath the front bay window.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application. There being no one, this portion of the hearing was declared closed.

APPLICATION NO. 4210-13. Michael Sipala seeks to construct a wood fence in the rear yard at 16 Raynor Lane.

Michael Sipala, Ironwood Landscaping, 41 Nott Street, appeared before the Commission. They would like to install a Victorian picket fence, a scalloped 707, made of cedar. A site plan was submitted. The fence will be in the back corner of the house to the hedge only on the west side of the property. It will be "L" shaped and there will also be a small length of fence between the house and the garage. There will be a gate on the corner of the house and a gate between the garage and the house. The fence will have 5 x 5 posts with a New England cap. They will use black wrought iron hardware.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application. There being no one, this portion of the hearing was declared closed.

APPLICATION NO. 4211-13. Cava LLC seeks to modify the stipulation on Certificate of Appropriateness number 4195-13 to change the stipulated material of the windows and doors at 277-287 Main Street.

Antonio Lenoci, 43 Pratt Street, Rocky Hill, and Ron Sager, Rogers Sash and Door, appeared before the Commission. They would like to replace the wood sash with aluminum clad wood sash. A sample was provided. They will get rid of the storm windows. All windows on the building will be replaced. They will be simulated divided light with a single vertical bar. They will all be Windsor 2/2 windows. They will also replace the three front and side windows where the trim doesn't match the originals. The windows are wood framed. They are not wrapped. They are an Azek material. If it doesn't match, the Azek will be painted. The trim is already painted white. The doors are wooden single glass doors. They would like to use a fiberglass one panel door with hardware to match existing. They will have a single light and a flat panel and they will be painted. The exterior trim will be rebuilt to match existing. All doors will swing out.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application.

Cindy Hughes, 14 Meggat Park, spoke in favor of the application.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone else wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application. There being no one, this portion of the hearing was declared closed.

APPLICATION NO. 4212-13. Linda Campbell seeks to modify the stipulation on Certificate of Appropriateness number 4198-13 to change the stipulated design of the rear porch at 297 Hartford Avenue.

Linda and James Campbell, 297 Hartford Avenue, appeared before the Commission. Drawings were submitted. It will have a 4" rail cap and a "beefier" post. There will be an open rail and a toe kick. There is bead molding, a rounded rail cap, and square ballisters. The 5" post details are to complement the front posts.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application.

Tim Gothers, 16 State Street, spoke in favor of the application.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application. There being no one, this portion of the hearing was declared closed.

APPLICATION NO. 4213-13. Stephen and Sheila Wells seek to replace the wood siding with James Hardie cementitious fiber siding at 336 Hartford Avenue.

Sheila Wells, 336 Hartford Avenue, and Tim Gothers, 16 State Street, appeared before the Commission. They would like to use a Hardie smooth siding with a 4" exposure and the same reveal. It will be pre-painted blue to match existing. The shutters and all details will remain the same.

Commissioner Garrey asked whether there was anyone wishing to speak in favor or in opposition to this application. There being no one, this portion of the hearing was declared closed.

Upon motion by Commissioner Rell seconded by Commissioner Greenblatt, and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to close the public hearing on all applications except Application Number 4206-13 and to open the public meeting.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond, Greenblatt

APPLICATION NO. 4207-13. George Bartholomay seeks to replace the wood siding with vinyl siding at 2 Howard Avenue.

Upon motion by Commissioner Ovian seconded by Commissioner Rell and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to DENY the application as submitted.

Discussion

Commissioner Greenblatt stated that she was surprised by the dramatic change that the siding would cause to this structure. There are other materials that might replicate that look and preserve some of the charm.

Commissioner Garrey stated they are very careful about each application standing on its own. There are various ways to approach this. There are other ways to deal with it like with a mix of sidings.

Commissioner Ovian stated that what is proposed is really different from what is existing. The commission has a history of being hesitant of approving siding changes like this – it is less than ½ the width of what's there. If it wasn't standard rolled 4" siding, he might consider it because it might reflect the era that the house was built, but this doesn't work for him. It's a difficult structure to have to deal with for siding nowadays. He doesn't know if the best product was presented to the commission. The problem with this is it leaves the mid-century window openings with a Colonial siding and it just doesn't work.

Aye: Garrey, Ovian, Rell, Raymond, Greenblatt

APPLICATION NO. 4208-13. Cactus Design LLC seeks to modify Certificate of Appropriateness number 4157-13 to change the siding from cement board to vinyl and to change the open wood trellis over the rear deck to a solid roof at 65 Robbinswood Drive.

Upon motion by Commissioner Garrey seconded by Commissioner Ovian and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application as submitted.

Discussion

Commissioner Garrey stated that this product has been successfully used in the District several times. This is a very prominent house. It is large with regard to the massing of the structure on the site and very visible between Anderson Farms and the Silas Robbins house. It needs to stand on its own and be harmonious but it is not to mimic the Hubbard houses. It's a new structure. The Hardie plank reads more like a wood product. He's a little concerned with this. He doesn't think the product is unsuccessful, he just doesn't know about the massing. This house will always be very prominent. He thinks that cementitious will read as a natural material and will be successful in this application.

Commissioner Ovian stated that if you look at this street, almost all of those houses have a natural material or read of a natural material and when you're close to the building, he thinks it's going to be hard for this house not to look like plastic next to all of those other houses. That's part of the difficulty. If this house were somewhere else in the District, you could more easily get away with it. The whole house feels about 10% bigger than he thought it would when they initially approved it. It is a beautiful home and it's great to have a new addition to the District, but he has reservations about whether plastic could do that.

Commissioner Raymond stated that you're right off of Board Street which is a very visible street. When you're right in front of one of the prettiest houses in the District, to put that material across the street from it, screams out in the wrong way. For everything else on the application, he has no problem whatsoever.

Nay: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond Recusal: Greenblatt

Upon motion by Commissioner Ovian seconded by Commissioner Rell and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application with the following stipulation:

1. The siding shall remain as previously approved on Certificate of Appropriateness number 4157-13 and shall be CertainTeed fiber cement board individual shakes with a straight edge.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond Recusal: Greenblatt

APPLICATION NO. 4209-13. Cactus Design LLC seeks to amend Certificate of Appropriateness number 4157-13 to 1) modify the kitchen window width by 8", 2) modify the two (2) sets of 5' wide sliding doors on the south elevation to one 10' wide sliding door, 3) reduce the soffit height from 10'6" to 8'8", 4) decrease the window heights by 8", and 5) remove the brackets beneath the front bay window at 65 Robbinswood Drive.

Upon motion by Commissioner Garrey seconded by Commissioner Raymond and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application as submitted.

Discussion

Commissioner Garrey stated that the windows that were changed are minimal impact.

Commissioner Ovian stated that all of the changes make sense.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond Recusal: Greenblatt

APPLICATION NO. 4210-13. Michael Sipala seeks to construct a wood fence in the rear yard at 16 Raynor Lane.

Upon motion by Commissioner Rell seconded by Commissioner Ovian and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application as submitted.

Discussion

Commissioner Garrey stated that they've seen this applicant's work. They've seen the exact fence and it's a beautiful fence and very appropriate to the location and structure.

Commissioner Ovian stated that the yard was made for that type of landscaping. It's hard to tell where the properties end and it will provide some nice definition.

Commissioner Rell stated that he did research beforehand and looking at some satellite views, prior to a tornado that came through, there was a fence there. This homeowner is trying to replicate what was there three or four years ago.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond, Greenblatt

APPLICATION NO. 4211-13. Cava LLC seeks to modify the stipulation on Certificate of Appropriateness number 4195-13 to change the stipulated material of the windows and doors at 277-287 Main Street.

Upon motion by Commissioner Ovian seconded by Commissioner Raymond and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application with the following stipulation:

1. The windows shall remain as approved. The doors shall be modified as presented tonight.

Discussion

Commissioner Garrey stated that a lot of aluminum clad windows have been used in the District and this is one of the better ones he has seen. The finish is very good and the muntin line is very good on this window. He has no problem with what was proposed. He thinks it was a very good compromise with what was originally proposed. The finish is one of the best he has seen at replicating wood.

Commissioner Ovian stated that he likes the idea of the 2/2 with the vertical bar. The problem is that the rest of the building is very old wood siding. It has bumps and wrinkles that you see in a building like this. It has a different pattern across the top. He doesn't think aluminum wrapped window sashes are consistent with the look of the aged siding even when painted. Whereas painted wood windows will make all the difference in the world. Nobody paints aluminum windows. This brand isn't as successful as replicating a wood window as Andersen Woodrite.

Commissioner Rell stated that he doesn't mind the window at all. While it is aluminum clad, it has been used in the District and has been previously approved. We had approved these windows on a prominent house on a prominent street.

Commissioner Raymond stated that they will be removing the aluminum storm windows.

Commissioner Greenblatt stated that she wasn't present for the initial application but the removal of the storms and look of this window will transform the building in a positive way. She's not sure if the bevel will create that big of a difference. The window presented is substantial and attractive. The window is appropriate and the 2/2 will be nice.

Aye: Ovian

Nay: Garrey, Rell, Raymond, Greenblatt

Upon motion by Commissioner Garrey seconded by Commissioner Rell and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application as submitted.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Raymond, Greenblatt Nay: Ovian

APPLICATION NO. 4212-13. Linda Campbell seeks to modify the stipulation on Certificate of Appropriateness number 4198-13 to change the stipulated design of the rear porch at 297 Hartford Avenue.

Upon motion by Commissioner Raymond seconded by Commissioner Greenblatt and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application as submitted.

Discussion

Commissioner Garrey stated that they didn't have adequate detail at the last meeting.

Commissioner Greenblatt stated that a lot of thought went into this design to eliminate concerns of the Commission and the neighbors.

Commissioner Raymond stated that it's a clear picture of what the applicant wants and it's something that will fit the house.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond, Greenblatt

APPLICATION NO. 4213-13. Stephen and Sheila Wells seek to replace the wood siding with James Hardie cementitious fiber siding at 336 Hartford Avenue.

Upon motion by Commissioner Raymond seconded by Commissioner Ovian and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application with the following stipulation:

1. The siding shall be James Hardie HardiePlank smooth with a 4" reveal pre-painted in the color "blue".

Discussion

Commissioner Garrey stated that this is a no impact change. It should read exactly as the house reads today.

Commissioner Rell stated that this is minimal impact.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond, Greenblatt

MINUTES OF OCTOBER 8, 2013

Upon motion by Commissioner Garrey, seconded by Commissioner Rell and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the minutes of the October 8, 2013 meeting.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Greenblatt

Abstain: Raymond

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS NUMBER 4106-12 – Jim Stavola seeks to extend the expiration date of Certificate of Appropriateness number 4106-12 on property located at 39-41 Middletown Avenue for one year with the new expiration date being October 22, 2014.

Upon motion by Commissioner Garrey, seconded by Commissioner Greenblatt and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the extension of the expiration date.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond, Greenblatt

CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS NUMBER 4204-13 – Adam Gove seeks clarification for the stipulation number 3 “*The garage door shall be a steel Wayne Dalton Garage door in the Ranch style with the Stockbridge light pattern with the muntins permanently affixed to the exterior*” at 47 Kenwood Avenue. The stipulated light pattern is not an option for the stipulated door style.

Upon motion by Commissioner Rell, seconded by Commissioner Garrey and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to APPROVE the application with the following stipulation:

2. The garage door shall be a steel Wayne Dalton garage door in the Ranch style with the Clear II light pattern with no hardware attached except for a lift handle.

Discussion

Commissioner Garrey stated that we didn't like the Sonoma style door. The Ranch style would be best and he could do the Clear 2 windows. The door is a very simple arts and crafts door with three lights.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond, Greenblatt

OTHER BUSINESS

Public comments on general matters of the Historic District

None.

Report of the Historic District Coordinator

None.

Correspondence

None.

ADJOURNMENT

Upon motion by Commissioner Rell, seconded by Commissioner Raymond and a poll of the Commission, it was voted to ADJOURN the meeting at 9:32 PM.

Aye: Garrey, Rell, Ovian, Raymond, Greenblatt

Respectfully Submitted

TOWN OF WETHERSFIELD
HISTORIC DISTRICT COMMISSION

Douglas Ovian
-Clerk Pro Tem -